DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 279 078 EA 019 200

AUTHOR Psacharopoulos, George
TITLE Why Educational Reforms Fail: A Comparative Analysis. Draft 2.
PUB DATE Mar 87
NOTE 28p.; Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the Comparative and International Education Society (Washington, DC, March 12-15, 1987).
PUB TYPE Speeches/Conference Papers (150) -- Viewpoints (120) -- Reports - Descriptive (141)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC02 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS *Comparative Education; *Developing Nations; *Educational Change; *Educational Policy; Educational Principles; Elementary Secondary Education; *Failure; Foreign Countries; Higher Education; *Policy Formation; Politics of Education; Program Effectiveness; Program Implementation; Vocational Education
IDENTIFIERS *Africa; Botswana; Ethiopia; Kenya; Lesotho; Swaziland; Tanzania; Uganda; UNESCO; Zambia

ABSTRACT

This paper presents an overview of educational policymaking in several developing countries in Africa by (1) examining the nature of various educational policies in these countries; (2) drawing comparative generalizations from the outcomes of the objectives of these policies; and (3) recommending ways to avoid the failure of educational reforms. Major educational policies in developing African nations have included the following: (1) primary education policies (increased coverage, quality improvement, and combining education with production); (2) secondary education policies (curriculum divsersification, technical and vocational education, and better links to employment); (3) vocational education policies; (4) higher education policies; and (5) other policies (including national unity, political ideology, financing, and regulation). Judging from the past record of educational policymaking in Africa, three main reasons emerge for the failure of many reforms to materialize. These reasons are: lack of implementation of the intended policy; partial implementation (including social rejection or the neglect of prerequisite factors); and implementation of unrealistic policies. To avoid past pitfalls, future policy statements should be concrete and feasible in terms of objectives, and the substance of a policy should be based on research-proved cause-effect relationships, rather than on goodwill intuition. Two tables are included, and two pages of references are appended. (IW)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED279078

Draft 2

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

X This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

George Psacharopoulos

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

WHY EDUCATIONAL REFORMS FAIL?

A COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS

by

George Psacharopoulos
The World Bank
Washington, D.C.

Paper presented at the
Comparative and International Education Society Meetings
Washington, D.C. March 12-15, 1987

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

EA 019 200

WHY EDUCATIONAL REFORMS FAIL?

by

George Psacharopoulos*

"Educational policy" is, perhaps, the contemporary equivalent of what twenty years ago was known as "educational planning". Whatever it is, and no matter how many other disguises it takes (like, "educational reform"), practically every country in the world has at one time or another proclaimed an intention or made a decision that would affect some aspect of schooling in society. It is in this wider sense that the term educational policy is used in this report.

Of course educational policy is proclaimed or a school reform is enacted, not for their own sake, but in order to serve a particular purpose. The purpose can be pedagogical, political, economic or any combination of other good causes according to the judgement of that impersonal entity often referred to as "the policy maker".

What has been the record of educational policy making in developing countries? Were intended reforms implemented in the first place, and if they were, did they have their expected effect? If not, why not? This paper attempts to give an answer to such complex questions by concentrating in one world region, Africa and on a handful, although typical, attempted reforms that span the full educational ladder.

---

* The World Bank, Washington, D.C. 20433. The views expressed here are those of the author and should not be attributed to the World Bank.

I. The Policies

Educational policy statements are found in a variety of official documents like:

a) Political statements or manifestos, e.g., Nyerere's most famous "Education for Self Reliance", The Workers' Party of Ethiopia "Programme", or Swaziland's "Imbokodvo National Manifesto".

b) Reports of special commissions, e.g., Zambia's "Lockwood Report", or Ethiopia's 1972 "Education Sector Review".

c) The country's educational plan, often embedded in the country's Development Plan, e.g., "Education", in Botswana's "National Development Plan 1979-85," (pp. 99-132), or Uganda's "Ten Year Development Plan, 1981-1990."

d) Ministry of Education Acts, Orders or Circulars, e.g., Lesotho's "National University Act, 1975".

e) Reports of international agencies, e.g., Unesco's 1961 "Outline of a Plan for African Educational Development" (better known as the "Addis Ababa Conference").

Policy statements in the above documents typically refer to the following:

- Primary Education: Increasing coverage, improving teaching quality, combining education with production, teaching in local languages.
- Secondary Education: Increasing coverage, diversifying the curriculum, improving links with employment.

- Vocational Education: Meeting manpower requirements, providing the skills needed by a modernizing economy.
- Higher Education: Indigenizing higher civil service, meeting high level manpower needs.
- Overall: Promoting cultural needs, serving political ideology, education financing and system regulation.

Let us follow the above taxonomy and document for a number of countries the exact formulation of policies, as stated in the official documents and, where possible, the outcome of such policies.

1. Primary Education Policies

Increased coverage. Such policy intention is encountered in practically every country in the region, from independence to date. For example, one resolution of the Addis Ababa Conference was that "All African States should aim at achieving universal primary education within a maximum of 20 years" (Unesco, 1961b, p.10). In Swaziland, "The ultimate goal is to achieve universal free primary education for every child " (Manifesto, 1972). In Lesotho, "Every... Mosotho child should complete a seven-year primary course" (Lesotho, Education Sector Survey Report, 1982,para 5.1).

Yet at the home of the Addis Ababa conference proposing a 71 percent participation rate in primary education by 1971, Ethiopia had only achieved 18 per cent by 1974. (Kiros, 1986, p.81). An attempt in Ethiopia to set less ambitious targets for the expansion of primary education -- the Minimum Formation Education, a result of the 1972 Education Sector Review -- which could last as little as one year and be terminal for most students was rejected, mainly by the teachers, and, according to some, it has contributed to the 1974 revolution

(Kiros, 1986, p.87). Also in Ethiopia, a major Literacy Campaign was launched in 1979 to eradicate illiteracy by 1987. Today, the illiteracy rate in Ethiopia is of the order of 45 percent (Unesco, 1985).

In Zambia, the 1962 National United Independence Party's (UNIP) "Educational Manifesto" promised compulsory primary education up to the age of 15. Although considerable progress was made over the next two decades in terms of increased coverage, the 1985 UNIP "Policies for the Decade 1985-95" reemphasized compulsory , but not free, education to grade 9 (i.e. to the end of junior secondary). (Achola, 1986, pp. 8 and 15).

In Uganda, the situation today is one of "increasing illiteracy" (Odaet, 1986, p....). And in Lesotho, "... although access to primary education is open to all, UPE has not been achieved. (Thelehani, 1986, p.22).

Rapid population growth is often blamed for the non-implementation of UPE in African countries. In Zambia, for example, when UPE was espoused in the early sixties the population growth rate was of the order of 2 percent. By 1985 it stood at 3.4 percent. "If... the Zambian government insists on its goal of universal basic education (grades 1-9) for all, 1.74 million additional school places would have to be added to the current 1.3 million by the year 2000... This is clearly a daunting task given that education will have to compete with other social services for increasingly dwindling national revenues" (Achola, 1986, p. 44).

Quality improvement. Of course beyond coverage, many African states set a goal to improve the quality of education children receive. Emphasis has been on: teacher training, construction of schols, student/teacher ratio. For example, in Zambia's first development plan (1966-70) the objective to improve primary education was by means of expanding teacher training. (Achola 1986, p. 18).

The 1963 Report of the Uganda Education Commission (paragraph 27) stated that "The task... is not just to provide more primary schools but to provide better primary education" . Yet in Uganda today there is a "high dropout rate at almost every level of the educational system" (Odaet, 1986, p...). "Training Colleges should be filled to capacity" (Uganda Education Commission, 1963, paragraph 142). "Teacher's salaries must not be allowed to fall below the general level of salaries... to arrest the drift into other occupations" (Kenya Education Commission, 1964, paragraph 549). "The raising of the teaching quality of Training Colleges is a high priority". (Uganda Education Commission, 1963, paragraph 143-144).

In Swaziland, the second development plan (1972-78) set the objective "to raise the quality of education by reducing the high incidents of drop-out and repeaters". (Cited by Magagula, 1986, p. 17). One way to do this, was to reduce the student-teacher ratio from 45:1 to 36:1 within the planning period. This indeed happened, although none of the expected effects followed: "Despite the reduction in the pupil-teacher ratio... instead of the normal 7 years to produce a primary school graduate, it took 12.6 years in 1981... The number of repeaters went up over the plan period... by nearly 50 percent...

There was no improvement in the overall pass rate SPCE during the plan period (Swaziland Primary Certificate Examination) ". (Magagula, 1986, p. 48).

In Lesotho, "In spite of...programs...geared to produce large numbers of teachers...there is a chronic shortage of teachers... worse in the sciences. The latest is the brain drain in South Africa where salaries are very high" (Telehani, 1986, p. 26). "...The push out rate is high. Only 14 percent of primary school graduates enter secondary education." Also, "...there is an apparent decline in the quality of education, like bad examination results. (Thelehani, 1986, p. 22).

After several years of emphasizing the improvement of the quality of education in Ethiopia, it is recognized that "... it has not been easy to raise the quality of education in a significant manner..." (The Workers' Party of Ethiopia, Programme, 197...., p. 96).

In Botswana, "...the quality of primary education has fallen short of people's expectations..." (Botswana National Development Plan, 1980, p. 99). In 1979 ...36% of [primary schools] classes were without a classroom of their own." (Botswana National Development Plan, 1985-91, p. 126).

In Tanzania "...there is a big shortage of teachers...By April 1982, primary schools in the country had a shortage of 34.94 percent of the required number of teachers." (Tanzania Ministry of Education, 1984, p. 12).

Combining education with production. The impetus for such policy change came from the strive for "relevance" in education. The Plan for Action (Unesco 1961b, p 21) clearly stated "That the

following measures be adopted for absorbing the surplus of unskilled manpower: (a) That primary education be given a practical bias." 1/ But in Tanzania, pursuant with "Education for Self-Reliance," the Third Five Year Development Plan states that "Work is to be more integrated with theoretical subjects" (Tanzania Ministry of Education, 1980, p. 24).

In Zimbabwe the Government also adopted the philosophy of education with production "...to make school experiences meaningful and worthwhile in terms of real life activities outside the school campus" (Mutumbuka, Education Minister, 1984, as cited by Maravanyika, 1986, p.27). But "The problem...was that most of the teachers did not understand the philosophy of education with production... Rather they saw it in terms of...activities associated with vocationalism long rejected by the Blacks during the colonial era...The schools... failed to attract staff with the appropriate qualifications for meaningful practical skills teaching...To date, Education with production is more of a slogan than a meaningful educational philosophy...". (Maravanyika, 1986, pp. 28-29).

In Lesotho also "The school system has definitely failed to produce...persons ready to be involved in rural and manual work..." (Thelejani, 1986, p. 25). "...Practical subjects are regarded by learners and parents as second rate in the educational scene.

1/ For at least two notable exceptions to this rule, the 1963 Uganda Education Commission (paragraph 47) states: "Agriculture is not a suitable subbject for primary schools". Also in Kenya, "...we do not recommend the inclusion of a specifically vocational element in the primary course". (Kenya, Report of the National Committee on Educational Objectives and Policies, 19??, para 27).

Incidentally, the introduction of practical subjects is an attempt to make education relevant" (Telejani, 1986, p. 28).

In Zambia, "... production training should be a compulsory subject which shall form an integral part of the curriculum" (Zambia Ministry of Education, 1977, chapter 8, para. 13). "...the president issued a decree that... all educational institutions would combine education with productive activity. The...aims were to foster in pupils and students respect and love for manual work. The program has had only marginal impact on the students...Academic education, which paves the way for entry into the university attracts the most able students and subsequently offers the best rewards in terms of social standing..." (Achola, 1986, p. 45).

2. Secondary Education Policies

With some progress achieved in primary education, it was the next stage of education that naturally received attention: "The urgent need for expansion of secondary education is emphasized" (Uganda Education Commission, 1963, paragraph 58). But in Swaziland, the government decided in 1975 that "secondary system expansion was to be determined by manpower requirements" (Magagula 1986, p. 20), and so did, earlier on, Tanzania. In all African countries, the expansion of secondary education had to be linked, one way or another, to the world of work. E.g. "Education will be made more relevant to the world of work..." (Botswana National Development Plan, 1980, p. 99).

Curriculum diversification. This has been the equivalent of combining education with production at the secondary level: ..."To meet the demands of...African social and economic life...is the need to expand the curriculum at the second level in the direction of more

technical and vocational education. Such programmes are necessary to provide the skilled and semi-professional manpower essential for economic growth". (Unesco, 1961b, Addis Ababa Conference, Chapter 1, p.6; emphasis in the original). "The concept of 'secondary education' should be broadened to include practical training and to provide outlets into the production side of industry and agriculture" (Kenya, Report of the National Committee, 19??, para 56). "All the existing trade schools should be closed or transformed into the new type of secondary school with a vocational bias". (Uganda Commission on Education, 1963, Ch.VI). "A workshop... is a necessary part of the equipment of any secondary school ..." (Kenya, Report of the National Committee, 19??, para 74).

In Tanzania, "...secondary education vocationalization is to be realized so that each secondary school leavers will have a useful skill to the economy" (Tanzania Ministry of Education 1980, p. 24). "The general aim of education...is to ...prepare the young people for work...Secondary education is terminal and aims at equipping the pupils with skills...To achieve this, secondary education is divesified and vocationalized into commercial, technical, agricultural and home economics biases" (Tanzania Ministry of Education 1980, pp. 3, 4). Yet a recent evaluation of the diversification policy in Tanzania revealed that it failed to achieve the above objectives, e.g., one year after graduation, only 12 percent of the agricultural bias graduates were employed in agriculture, and only 5 percent followed further studies related to agriculture. (Psacharopoulos and Loxley, 1985, Tables 6-35 and 6-37). And "... many employers do not

recognize the level of competence in skills acquired... in the diversified schools." (Tanzania Ministry of Education, 1984, p. 23).

In Kenya also a tracer study of industrial school graduates did not reveal any employment advantage over a control group of academic secondary school graduates (Narman and others 1984, Table 3).

Better links to employment. The Addis Ababa Plan for Action (Unesco 1961b, p.22) recommended that the first step in the educational planning process should be "... an estimation of forward manpower requirements under the dual system of occupational and educational classification... undertaken by each country with the help of Unesco". Most countries followed such recommendation. E.g., in Kenya, "From the manpower figures we calculate a...requirement of Form I entries of 66,000..., but...believing that this is an underestimate.. we approve to provide facilities for about 87,000 pupils..." (Kenya Education Commission 1964, paragraphs 664-666).

Ethiopia introduced a system of comprehensive secondary schools in 1962 "designed to meet the...middle-level manpower demand in technical and commercial fields...[but] by 1969 the system was found to be defective...When tools stand idle for two to six years or more" (Kiros 1986, p. 67). In spite of the manpower orientation of development plans in Ethiopia, as early as 1973 shortages and surpluses were reported for key occupations (Kiros, 1986, p.71). By 1981 the situation had become worse (Kiros, 1986, p.123).

In Uganda, also, in spite of a long tradition with manpower planning, there is a "widening gap between the educational programs offered in schools...and the actual openings available ... in the employment market" (Odaet 1986, p.). And In Botswana, "Manpower

shortages persist, and the country remains over dependent on the skills of expatriates" (Botswana National Development Plan, 1980, p. 99).

It should be noted that fifteen years ago Jolly and Colclough (1972) surveyed over thirty manpower plans in Africa and concluded that these "...manpower plans... inadequately served the planners" (p. 254). Yet in many African countries today, such plans continue to be elaborated.

3. Vocational education policies

Vocationalism had a long tradition in Africa. The already mentioned 1961 recommendations of Unesco's Plan for Action were echoed in the policy documents of many countries. In Swaziland, for example, "...the content of education must be work-oriented from the primary to the highest levels" (Swaziland Manifesto, 19??). Also, Swaziland's second development plan (1973-78) sets the objective "to reorient the curricula at both primary and secondary levels so as to...enable school leavers to move naturally into the employment sectors" (cited by Magagula 1986, p.17). "A permanent machinery should be established to ensure an adequate link between the supply and demand for trained manpower on the one hand, and to relate school curriculum to national employment prospects. A comprehensive National Manpower Survey should be conducted to identify manpower requirements at all levels and feed back the information to the school system". (Swaziland National Education Review Commission, 1884? as cited by Magagula, 1986).

In Zambia, "The main method of providing technical education in...institutes under the Department of Technical Education and

Vocational Training should be...full-time pre-employment training in contrast to the apprenticeship method" (Zambia Ministry of Education 1977, chapter 9, para 4).

In spite of such manpower orientation, unemployment is still very high in Africa today, while there are severe scarcities in some skills. In Zambia for example, "estimates range between 1 and 1.5 million unemployed...school leavers...The government has responded... by trying to popularize the agricultural sector...The...efforts have, however, produced marginal success because of a strong negative attitude towards farming...Distaste for manual work on the land is deeply rooted in Zambia..." (Achola, 1986, pp. 44-45). And in spite of the early emphasis on vocational secondary schools in Ethiopia, "Many more students went to academic secondary schools ...many more opportunities were offered in academic secondary schools than in vocational ones" (Trudeau 1964, as cited by Kiros, 1986, p.36). And "It is quite clear that the manpower planning exercise in Tanzania has been counterproductive, leading to a worsening of the fit between the supply of and demand for high- and medium-level workers..." (Cooksey, 1986, p. 200).

4. <u>Higher Education Policies</u>

These have been dominated by attempts to meet high level manpower needs or to Africanize higher civil service. For example, "The...University...will be strengthened to meet future skilled manpower requirements in those disciplines for which the manpower study...shows it to be necessary'. (Lesotho, Second Five Year Plan, 1975?, para 7.22). Or, "To expand facilities for tertiary education in order to meet the manpower requirements of both public and private

sectors" (Swaziland Second Development Plan, 1973-78, as cited by Magagula 1986, p.17), and "To provide technical skills through education and training to meet the high level manpower requirements for the economy" (Uganda, 1981 Development Plan, para. 22.13m, (a)).

But in spite of such orientation, severe shortages are reported in some fields in Africa today, while there are surpluses in others (Hinchliffe, 1986). And although Zambia has completed Zambianization almost completely within the administration, "the country has continued to rely on expatriates to fill many technical and professional jobs" (Achola, 1986, p.53).

5. Other Policies

Beyond the above set of policies referring to the respective levels of education, a host of other policies were formulated to serve various objectives that cut across levels.

National Unity. For example, "the purpose of education is to produce an enlightened and participant citizenry...The policy...is that all education should...inculcate love for the land, loyalty to the King and country, self-respect, self-discipline, respect for the law accompanied by the highest degree of knowledge and the building of character". (Swaziland Imbokodvo National Manifesto, as cited by Magagula, 1986, p.5).

Also, teaching in local language has been a common policy for cultural unity, eg, "...Kiswahili should be the main vehicle for literacy work..." (Kenya, Report of the National Committee, 19??, para 104). Or, in Zambia "...the widespread use of English as a medium of instruction...has promoted a sense of national unity... The national motto of 'One Zambia, One Nation' could hardly make sense without a

unifying language..." (Achola 1986, p. 54). But in Lesotho, "Officially the medium of instruction is Sesotho until the 4th grade... In reality a mixture of languages may go on... This is partly blamed for the low standard in English..." (Telehani, 1986, p. 26).

Political ideology. In Tanzania, soon after the Arusha Declaration on Socialism and Self-Reliance, Nyerere issued a major paper on Education for Self-Reliance (ESR). [For a superb analysis of ESR see Morrison (1976), chapter 11.] This paper became the basis of all major educational changes in the country, implemented by the 1969 Education Act. (Tanzania Ministry of Education, 1980, p. 2). The 1974 Musoma Resolution called "... that education be integrated with work," in order to develop "in each citizen ...an Ujamaa or socialist outlook" (Tanzania Ministry of Education 1980, p.3).

In Ethiopia, Proclamation No.11 of 1974 setting out the objectives of the Development Campaign states as one of its objectives "to rid the people of self-seeking individualism and instill in them a spirit of cooperativeness for the common good" (Negarit Gazeta, No. 10, 25 November 1974, p.41). "The Minister of Education shall...ensure that the educational curriculum is prepared on the basis of Hebrettesebawinet (socialism)", (Negarit Gazeta, No. 29, 26 August 1977, article 11).

According to the Zimbabwe Minister of Education "The curriculum in our education system should be seen and considered as a vehicle towards the establishment of a socialist society" (Mutumbuka 1984, as cited by Maravanyika 1986, p.26). Yet "...educational policies in Zimbabwe appear to be adversely influenced by an inherent dichotomy in the country's ideological orientation. On the one hand

are the politicians bent on introducing Marxist-Leninist ideology which is unfamiliar to most people..., and on the other hand is the more...entrenched capitalist infrastructure bequeathed by the colonial administration. This is more familiar and people are prepared to take a chance with it as they see others around them who have succeeded by it...The majority of Blacks appear to be interested in the kind of education they had been denied than on something new and unfamiliar" (Maravanyika, 1986, p.30).

Financing

Although every educational reform must have substantial financial implications, this issue is only rarely addressed. Or if it is addressed, it is relegated for further study or to third parties. For example, it is a mistake to think that the ambitious program set out in the 1961 Unesco Addis Ababa Conference did not consider the financing aspect of the program. However, it delegated it to third parties: "Invites Unesco to approach the competent international organizations, governments and public and private institutions capable of providing large-scale assistance with the request that they contribute to the financing of such programs recommended by the conference as are beyond the present normal resources of the African countries concerned" (Unesco, 1961a, Chapter 8, Resolution No.1).

In the Plan for Action that followed the Conference it was stated that, "It must be possible to finance both the recurring and non-recurring costs of education...from loans as well as taxation" (Unesco, 1961b, p.10). And later, "That an increase in national education budgets requires use of new financial sources, both public

and private, national and foreign, material and human" (Unesco 1961, Plan, p. 20).

According to the Uganda Ten Year Development Plan, "An education tax will be introduced to augment the resource base of educational institutions... Public, parastatal and private organizations will be encouraged to provide a training fund that will finance training...".(Uganda, Ten Year Reconstruction and Development Plan 1981-1990", 1981, paragraph 22.6).

It is interesting to note changes in the financing policy of schools, even within a few years. For example in Swaziland, the first development plan (1969-73) states that primary and secondary education should be free. In the second development plan, however, (1973-78), the word "free" is dropped. (Magagula, 1986, p.20). In Botswana, "...a proportion of the costs will be shared by the community..." (Bostwana, 1984, P. 3?).

In Tanzania, the 1982 Presidential Commission on Education watered down the earlier strict manpower forecasting criterion for the expansion of secondary education: "Both the 'Social Demand' and 'Manpower Needs' approaches will be used in development plans..." (Tanzania Mininistry of Education 1984 p. 10). "Parents of pupils attending secondary schools will now be required to contribute towards part of the cost of their children's education..." (Tanzania Ministry of Education, 1984, p. 17). Thus, in January 1985 a fee [of 1600 shillings per year] was imposed, which is equivalent to two months' salary of a clerk.

Yet, in spite of such efforts, the financing of the recurrent cost of educational investment is the main constraint to further

expansion or improvement of the system's quality in African countries, as well as elsewhere (World Bank, 1986).

Regulation

All African states have chosen to regulate non-government educational institutions in the name of quality control, equity or political ideology. For example, "The control of education lies with the government of Swaziland whether it concerns state schools, subsidized schools or private undertakings" (Imbokodvo Manifesto 1972). Or, "Independent technical and commercial colleges should be carefully controlled and high standards encouraged by a system of 'recognition as efficient'". (Kenya, National Committee on Education, 19??, para 111).

In 1975, the Provisional Military Administrative Council abolished private schools in Ethiopia at the stroke of a pen : "Private schools are hereby transferred to public ownership" (Negarit Gazeta, No.3, 29 September 1975, p.19).

Yet even in a socialist country like Tanzania, over 40 percent of the enrollment in secondary schools in 1979 was in private institutions. (Tanzania Ministry of Education 1980, p. 35). In fact in Tanzania the share of secondary enrollments in private schools has nearly doubled between 1970 and 1983, 24 and 44 percent, respectively (Bellew, 1986, p. 15).

II. Comparative Lessons

Are there any generalizations that can be drawn from the above examples of educational policy objectives and outcomes in a handful of African countries. Looking at the past record of educational policy making in Africa, (and possibly elsewhere), there are three main reasons why an intention or a reform may ex post not materialize or be seen as a failure:

a) The intended policy was never implemented in the first place.

b) Even if an attempt at implementation was made, it failed to be completed or achieve a minimum critical mass as to have an impact.

c) Although the policy was implemented, it did not have the intended effect

Sub-reasons for failure within each of the above categories are as follows:

No implementation:

- The policy intention was too vague, e.g. "the quality of education should be improved"
- The intended policy was a lip service, political statement, e.g., "there will be free education for all"

Partial implementation:

- Neglect of a prerequisite factor, e.g., feasibility of financing
- Social rejection, e.g. vocational schools boycotted by parents

Implementation but no effect:

- Policy based on invalid theoretical model, e.g., basing educational expansion on manpower requirements
- Policy based on insufficient information/evidence, e.g., not knowing the exact number of teachers on the payroll in the first place.

Of course the definition of a success or failure is a subjective matter. And the vague formulation of policy objectives makes evaluation even more difficult. But to me, at least, announcing a policy and exciting people's expectations on an outcome that everyone knows at the outset it is doomed, is a failure. To put it differently, impossibility of implementation, or even partial implementation, is a negative signal on the validity of any policy.

But let us revisit the report of the Conference of African States on the Development of Education in Africa (Unesco 1961, p. 18, C.1) that set the following targets for the 1961-1980 period:

"(a) primary education shall be universal, compulsory and free;

(b) education at the second level shall be provided to 30 percent of those who complete primary education;

(c) higher education shall be provided...to 20 percent of those who complete secondary education;

(d) the improvement of the quality of African schools and universities shall be a constant aim".

It does not take a thorough investigation to conclude that none of the good intentions put forward in this, and many other documents, have not been achieved. It is true that a lot of progress

has been made in African education in the last twenty years, especially regarding increased coverage. (Bellew, 1986). Yet the outcomes are nowhere near the expectations. Table 1 shows how the Addis Ababa quantitative plans compare to the realizations.

Table 1

Enrollment Ratios in Africa: Planned versus Actual (percent)

Educational Level	Actual 1960 (1)	Planned 1980 (2)	Actual 1980 (3)	Actual vs planned shortfall (4)
Primary	40	100	76	24
Secondary	3	23	16	30
Higher	0.2	2	1	50

Source: Cols 1 and 2, from Unesco, 1961, p. 19. Col. 3 from Bellew (1986) pp. 9-11. Col. 4 = [(Col. 2 - Col.3)/ Col.2] x 100.

The above averages of course hide the situation in individual countries, e.g., the primary enrollment ratio in the semi-arid low-income countries was only 28 percent in 1980, and 35 percent in Ethiopia in the same year (Bellew, 1986,). Why such record? The degree of success or effect of a given policy is the product of two probabilities: that of the policy been implemented in the first place, and second that of yielding the intended effect:

$$\text{POLICY EFFECT} = \left(\text{PROB implementation}\right) \times \left(\text{PROB effect}\right)$$

At least in one African country, "...More has been achieved in enunciating new policy statements or in perfecting change rhetoric than in implementing or institutionalizing change" (Maravanyika, 1986, pp. 3-4). This statement must apply to others since Craig (1986) in

reviewing 153 educational policies in sub-Saharan Africa, came to the conclusion that only a handful were implemented (Table 5). The rarely implemented policies mostly referred to educational expansion and the Harambee schools.

Table 2

The Record of Policy Implementation

Degree of Implementation	Number of cases	%
Unclear	28	18
None or little	113	74
Mostly	7	5
Fully	5	3
Total	153	100

Source: Craig (1986), p. 22.

Of course there were moments of brilliance or pragmatism, but these are exceptions rather than the rule. For example, "The problems of agricultural educational are not primarily educational, but are bound up with economic and social problems over which the Ministry of Education has no control" (Uganda Education Commission, 1963, Para 107). Or, "Some aspects of the educational reform should be implemented while others can only be implemented over a period of time, bearing in mind changing circumstances and constraints" (Zambia, Ministry of Education 1977, chapter 17, paragraphs 2, 3). And rarely performance criteria have been set, like "Successful agricultural education depends largely on visible evidence of successful farming". Uganda Education Commission, 1963, para 114).

Most often, instead, there have been ambitious statements, like: "Educational reforms should seek to improve quality without sacrificing quantity" (Zambia Ministry of Education, Educational Reform: Proposals and Recommendations, 1977, Chapter 3, para 2). Or, "To provide increasing employment opportunities aimed at eliminating unemployment and underemployment in the country; and to insure absorption of trained manpower in appropriate positions" (Uganda Development Plan, 1981, paragraph 22.13 b, c.

It is often said that educational reform alone is not possible without parallel transformations in society (Ergas 1982??). Yet countries that have adopted holistic social transformations, and placed education within such transformations (e.g., Tanzania since 1967 and Ethiopia since 1974) do not appear to have shown major successes relative to other countries that have adopted in isolation some of the same policies. "Ethiopia was probably the first independent African country South of the Sahara to introduce comprehensive development planning...As the evidence has shown, there was little systematic effort made to translate plans into action" (Kiros 1986, p.45a).

Unrealistic policies naturally lead to reversals, even within only one year. In Zambia, for example, in 1975 a radical educational reform was announced ("Education for Development" 1976). In 1977 another document, "Educational Reform: Proposals and Recommendations," reversed the 1976 policies (Lulat, 1982).

III. Concluding Remarks

The above record gives a very pessimistic outlook regarding the success of educational reforms that are proposed today. For, in order to avoid past pitfalls, the following conditions should be met in formulating educational policies:

a) A policy statement should be concrete and feasible in terms of objectives, including a timetable source of financing of its implementation, and institution responsible, e.g., "the net primary enrollment ratio in rural district X will increase from 30 to 50 percent by 1995, financed by a 2 percent tax on beer".

b) The substance of a policy should be based on research-proved cause-effect relationships -- not goodwill intuition. For example, this should exclude expanding the educational system on manpower needs, or forcing students to enroll in types of schools and curricula for which the rewards in society are modest. Most countries use only a handful of tools for objectives (e.g., primary schooling only focus on buildings and training, expansion). Not many plans include things like: means of delivery, curriculum, etc.

Unfortunately, concreteness cannot be easily observed in political statements, and the intuitive power of "I know what the country needs" is much stronger than whatever research results demonstrate. It is for this reason that ambitious but rarely implemented and non-effect policy statements, as those in the above anthology, will continue to be with us in the foreseeable future.

Perhaps the only course of action for the serious policy maker would be to abstract from educational policy fireworks and concentrate in the documentation of cause-effect relationships -- the only activity, in my opinion, that can lead to successful school reforms.

REFERENCES

Achola, P.P.W., "Educational Policies in Zambia: A Historical Account and a Critical Appraisal," Education and Training Department, The World Bank, 1986.

Bellew, R. "African Education and Socioeconomic Indicators," World Bank Education and Training Department, Report No. EDT39, 1986.

Botswana Ministry of Education, Education through Partnership: Intermediate Schools of the Future, Ministry of Education, 1984.

Botswana Ministry of Finance and Development Planning, National Development Plan 1979-85, Gaborone, 1980.

Botswana Ministry of Finance and Development Planning, National Development Plan 1985-91, Gaborone, 1984?

Cooksey, B., "Policy and Practice in Tanzanian Secondary Education Since 1967," International Journal of Educational Development, 6, No. 3, 1986: 183-202.

Craig, J. E., "Implementing Educational Policies in Sub-Saharan Africa: A Review of the Literature," Educational and Training Department, The World Bank, 1986.

Ergas, Z., "Can Education be Used as Tool to Build a Socialist Society in Africa? The Tanzanian Case,", Journal of Modern African Studies, 20, 4, 1982: 571-594.

Eshiwani, G. "Educational Policies in Kenya: A Historical Account and a Critical Appraisal", Education and Training Department, The World Bank, 1986.

Ethiopia Government, The Workers' Party of Ethiopia: Programme, Addis Ababa, 197??.

Hinchliffe, K., "Higher Education in Sub-Saharan Africa," Education and Training Department, The World Bank, 1986.

Jolly, R. and Colclough, C., "African Manpower Plans: An Evaluation", International Labor Review, 106-2-3, (August-September 1972): 207-264.

Kiros, F.G., "Educational Policies in Ethiopia, 1941-1985: A Historical Account and a Critical Appraisal," Education and Training Department, The World Bank, 1986.

Lulat, Y.G.M., "Political Constraints on Educational Reform for Development: Lessons from an African Experience," Comparative Education Review, 26, June 1982: 235-253.

Magagula, C., "Educational Policies in Swaziland: A Historical Account and a Critical Appraisal," Education and Training Department, The World Bank.

Maravanyika, O.E., "Educational Policies in Zimbabwe: A Historical and a Critical Appraisal," Education and Training Department, The World Bank, 1986.

Morrison, D.R., Education and Politics in Africa: The Tanzanian Case, Hurst & Co., 1976.

Nyerere, J., Education for Self-Reliance, Dar-es-Salaam, 1967.

Odaet, C. F., "Educational Policies in Uganda: A Historical Account and a Critical Appraisal," Education and Training Department, The World Bank, 1986.

Psacharopoulos, G. and Loxley, W., Diversified Secondary Education and Development: Evidence from Colombia and Tanzania, Johns Hopkins University Press, 1985.

Tanzania Ministry of Education, Educational System in Tanzania towards the Year 2000. Dar es Salaam, 1984.

Tanzania Ministry of Education, Basic Facts about Educatioon in Tanzania, Dar es Salaam, 1980.

Thelejani, T. S., "Educational Policies in Lesotho: A Historical Account a Critical Appraisal," Education and Training Department, The World Bank, 1986.

Trudeau, E., Higher Education in Ethiopia, Montreal, 1964.

Unesco, Final Report, Conference of African States on the Development of Education in Africa, Unesco 1961a.

Unesco, Outline of a Plan for African Educational Development, Unesco, 1961b.

Unesco, Statistical Yearbook, 1985.

World Bank, Financing Education in Developing Countries: An Exploration of Policy Options, The World Bank, 1986.